

# **Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers**

Diane M. Juffras

2013



UNC  
SCHOOL OF  
GOVERNMENT

The School of Government at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill works to improve the lives of North Carolinians by engaging in practical scholarship that helps public officials and citizens understand and improve state and local government. Established in 1931 as the Institute of Government, the School provides educational, advisory, and research services for state and local governments. The School of Government is also home to a nationally ranked graduate program in public administration and specialized centers focused on information technology and environmental finance.

As the largest university-based local government training, advisory, and research organization in the United States, the School of Government offers up to 200 courses, webinars, and specialized conferences for more than 12,000 public officials each year. In addition, faculty members annually publish approximately fifty books, book chapters, bulletins, and other reference works related to state and local government. Each day that the General Assembly is in session, the School produces the *Daily Bulletin*, which reports on the day's activities for members of the legislature and others who need to follow the course of legislation.

The Master of Public Administration Program is a full-time, two-year program that serves up to sixty students annually. It consistently ranks among the best public administration graduate programs in the country, particularly in city management. With courses ranging from public policy analysis to ethics and management, the program educates leaders for local, state, and federal governments and nonprofit organizations.

Operating support for the School of Government's programs and activities comes from many sources, including state appropriations, local government membership dues, private contributions, publication sales, course fees, and service contracts. Visit [www.sog.unc.edu](http://www.sog.unc.edu) or call 919.966.5381 for more information on the School's courses, publications, programs, and services.

Michael R. Smith, DEAN

Thomas H. Thornburg, SENIOR ASSOCIATE DEAN

Frayda S. Bluestein, ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR FACULTY DEVELOPMENT

L. Ellen Bradley, ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR PROGRAMS AND MARKETING

Todd A. Nicolet, ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR OPERATIONS

Ann Cary Simpson, ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR DEVELOPMENT

Bradley G. Volk, ASSOCIATE DEAN FOR ADMINISTRATION

## FACULTY

Whitney Afonso

Gregory S. Allison

David N. Ammons

Ann M. Anderson

A. Fleming Bell, II

Maureen M. Berner

Mark F. Botts

Michael Crowell

Leisha DeHart-Davis

Shea Riggsbee Denning

James C. Drennan

Richard D. Ducker

Joseph S. Ferrell

Alyson A. Grine

Norma Houston

Cheryl Daniels Howell

Jeffrey A. Hughes

Willow S. Jacobson

Robert P. Joyce

Kenneth L. Joyner

Diane M. Juffras

Dona G. Lewandowski

Adam Lovelady

James M. Markham

Janet Mason

Christopher B. McLaughlin

Laurie L. Mesibov

Kara A. Millonzi

Jill D. Moore

Jonathan Q. Morgan

Ricardo S. Morse

C. Tyler Mulligan

David W. Owens

William C. Rivenbark

Dale J. Roenigk

John Rubin

Jessica Smith

Karl W. Smith

Carl W. Stenberg III

John B. Stephens

Charles Szypszak

Shannon H. Tufts

Vaughn Upshaw

Aimee N. Wall

Jeffrey B. Welty

Richard B. Whisnant

© 2013

School of Government

The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Use of this publication for commercial purposes or without acknowledgment of its source is prohibited. Reproducing, distributing, or otherwise making available to a non-purchaser the entire publication, or a substantial portion of it, without express permission, is prohibited.

Printed in the United States of America

17 16 15 14 13 1 2 3 4 5

ISBN 978-1-56011-730-8

∞ This publication is printed on permanent, acid-free paper in compliance with the North Carolina General Statutes.

♻️ Printed on recycled paper

# Summary Contents

**Preface** xv

**Introduction** 1

Chapter 1

**An Overview of the Laws Governing Recruitment and Selection** 13

Chapter 2

**Discrimination Law in the Recruitment and Selection Context** 33

Chapter 3

**Defining and Advertising the Job** 109

Chapter 4

**Personnel Policies Related to Recruitment and Selection** 139

**Chapter 5**

**Lawful and Unlawful Questions: Applications and Interviewing** 159

**Chapter 6**

**Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Written Examinations** 211

**Chapter 7**

**Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Physical Ability Tests and Assessment Centers** 247

**Chapter 8**

**Background Investigations of Applicants for Employment: Criminal Records, Credit History, Reference, and Internet Checks** 263

**Chapter 9**

**Hiring Employees versus Engaging Independent Contractors** 311

**Chapter 10**

**Applicant Records: Confidentiality and Retention** 345

**Appendixes** 357

**Indexes** 401

# Table of Contents

**Preface** xv

**Introduction** 1

**North Carolina Local Government and Community College**

**Employers: Who Are They?** 5

Community Colleges 5

Local Government Entities Not Covered by This Book 6

**Small Employers** 6

**Initial Hiring versus Promoting from Within** 7

**A Summary of the Book's Contents** 8

## **Chapter 1**

**An Overview of the Laws Governing Recruitment and Selection** 13

1.1 The Common Law Rule of Employment at Will 15

1.2 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Local Government 17

1.2.1 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Municipalities 17

1.2.2 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Counties 19

1.2.3 Hiring Authority in Mental Health Area Authorities/  
Local Management Entities 25

1.2.4 Hiring Authority in Other Kinds of Local  
Government Entities 26

<b>1.3 Hiring Authority in North Carolina’s Community Colleges</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>1.4 Laws Affecting the Process of Recruitment and Selection</b>	<b>27</b>
1.4.1 The Fair Credit Reporting Act	27
1.4.2 The Immigration Reform and Control Act	28
1.4.3 North Carolina’s E-Verify Requirement	28
1.4.4 The Law Protecting the Lawful Use of Lawful Products	29
1.4.5 North Carolina’s Requirement of United States Selective Service Registration	30
1.4.6 North Carolina’s Defense against Civil Liability for Truthful Job References	30
1.4.7 North Carolina’s Prohibition against Requiring Applicants to Pay the Cost of Exams or Records	30

## Chapter 2

### **Discrimination Law in the Recruitment and Selection Context**      33

<b>2.1 Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964: Prohibition against Hiring Decisions Made on the Basis of Race, Color, Gender, Religion, or National Origin</b>	<b>38</b>
2.1.1 Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination in Hiring: The Basic Theory	38
2.1.2 Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination in Making Promotions	42
2.1.3 Mixed Motives: When Discrimination Is Only One Factor in a Decision Not to Hire or Promote	43
2.1.4 The Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense to a Charge of Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination	44
2.1.5 A Closer Look at Title VII Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination	45
2.1.6 Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination in Hiring: The Basic Theory	57
2.1.7 A Closer Look at Title VII Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination	62
<b>2.2 The Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967: Prohibition against Hiring Decisions Made on the Basis of Age over 40</b>	<b>69</b>
2.2.1 Disparate Treatment or Unintentional Discrimination under the ADEA	70
2.2.2 A Closer Look at Disparate Treatment under the ADEA: Mixed-Motive Cases	80

2.2.3	Unintentional or Disparate Impact Discrimination under the ADEA	80
2.3	North Carolina Law Prohibiting Discrimination on the Basis of Race, Color, Gender, Religion, National Origin, or Age	82
2.4	The Americans with Disabilities Act	83
2.4.1	Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination under the ADA	85
2.4.2	Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination under the ADA	86
2.4.3	Three Things That Make the ADA Different from Title VII and the ADEA	90
2.4.4	A Closer Look at the ADA	95
2.5	North Carolina Law Prohibiting Disability Discrimination	97
2.6	Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act	97
2.6.1	GINA's Impact on the Hiring Process	99
2.7	North Carolina Law Prohibiting Discrimination Based on Genetic Information	100
2.8	The Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act	100
2.8.1	Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination under USERRA	102
2.8.2	Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination under USERRA	102
2.8.3	USERRA and the Promotional Process	103
2.8.4	Filling Vacancies Caused by Military Leave	103
2.9	North Carolina Law Protecting Those Who Serve in the Military from Discrimination	104
2.10	The Equal Protection Clause of the United States Constitution	105
2.11	Affirmative Action and Local Government Hiring	107

## Chapter 3

### Defining and Advertising the Job 109

3.1	Legal Issues Raised by Job Descriptions	112
3.1.1	Job Descriptions and ADA Discrimination Claims	112
3.1.2	Job Descriptions and Title VII Discrimination Claims	115
3.1.3	Preferred versus Required Qualifications	116

- 3.2 Legal Issues Raised by Job Advertisements 119
  - 3.2.1 Accountant Wanted: A Hypothetical Job Advertisement 120
  - 3.2.2 Advertising a Position 127
  - 3.2.3 Choosing Not to Advertise a Position 128
  - 3.2.4 Using the North Carolina Employment Security Commission to Advertise Positions and Screen Applicants 137

## Chapter 4

### Personnel Policies Related to Recruitment and Selection 139

- 4.1 Residency Requirements 141
  - 4.1.1 Three Types of Legal Challenges to Residency Requirements 143
- 4.2 Anti-Nepotism Policies 151
- 4.3 Policies Prohibiting the Rehiring of Former Employees 157

## Chapter 5

### Lawful and Unlawful Questions: Applications and Interviewing 159

- An Initial Matter: Application versus Interview 161
- Expressly Unlawful Questions versus Questions Better Left Unasked 162
- 5.1 Expressly Unlawful Questions: The Americans with Disabilities Act 164
  - 5.1.1 The ADA's Prohibition on Pre-Offer Medical Inquiries and Examinations 166
  - 5.1.2 Areas That Employers Typically Want to Explore with Applicants 168
  - 5.1.3 When Is an Offer an Offer for ADA Purposes? 183
  - 5.1.4 Post-Offer Medical Examinations 186
  - 5.1.5 Withdrawing an Offer Based on the Results of a Medical Inquiry or Examination 187
- 5.2 Expressly Unlawful Questions: The Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act 192
  - 5.2.1 What Happens When an Employer Violates the ADA or GINA's Rules on Medical Questions and Examinations? 194



<b>5.3 Bottom Line: Pre-Employment Questions and Medical Examinations under the ADA and GINA</b>	194
<b>5.4 Questions Giving Rise to Inferences of Discrimination Based on Race, Color, Gender, Religion, National Origin, or Age</b>	195
5.4.1 Questions about Family Status	196
5.4.2 Questions about Age or Date of Birth	201
5.4.3 Questions about Educational History	202
5.4.4 Questions about Religion	204
5.4.5 Questions about National Origin	208
5.4.6 Criminal History	209
5.4.7 Credit History	210

## Chapter 6

### **Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Written Examinations**

<b>6.1 Scored Testing and Disparate Impact: A Hypothetical</b>	215
<b>6.2 Step One: Conducting a Job Analysis</b>	219
<b>6.3 Step Two: Constructing a Written Test of Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities</b>	224
<b>6.4 Responding to a Written Test That Causes Disparate Impact</b>	226
6.4.1 Score Banding and Race Norming	227
6.4.2 Cutoff Scores and Rank Order Selection	228
6.4.3 Is an Employer Liable for Disparate Impact Where the Bottom Line Is Good?	231
<b>6.5 The Written Test Dilemma: The U.S. Supreme Court's Decision in <i>Ricci v. DeStefano</i></b>	232
6.5.1 The Background	233
6.5.2 Constructing the Test	234
6.5.3 Results of the Tests	235
6.5.4 The Lawsuit	236
6.5.5 The Legal Analysis: The Majority Opinion	237
6.5.6 Legal Analysis: The Dissent	240
<b>6.6 After <i>Ricci v. DeStefano</i>: Should a Local Government Employer Use Written Examinations for Hiring and Promotion?</b>	242
<b>6.7 A Note about the Americans with Disabilities Act and Employment Testing</b>	243

## Chapter 7

### **Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Physical Ability Tests and Assessment Centers** 247

- 7.1 Physical Ability Tests 249
  - 7.1.1 Using Physical Ability Tests Validated for Other Employers 250
  - 7.1.2 Validating Cutoff Scores for Physical Ability Testing That Have a Disparate Impact on Women 254
- 7.2 Assessment Centers 256
  - 7.2.1 An Example of a Valid Law Enforcement Assessment Center 257
  - 7.2.2 An Example of a Firefighter Assessment Center That Could Not Be Validated 260
  - 7.2.3 Assessment Centers in Sum 262

## Chapter 8

### **Background Investigations of Applicants for Employment: Criminal Records, Credit History, Reference, and Internet Checks** 263

- 8.1 Reasons for Conducting Background Investigations 266
  - 8.1.1 Fear of Negligent Hiring Claims Not a Reason to Conduct a Background Check 266
- 8.2 Criminal History Record Checks 267
  - 8.2.1 Blanket Disqualification of Applicants with Criminal Records Prohibited 268
  - 8.2.2 How to Construct a Targeted Screen 276
  - 8.2.3 The Catch-22 for Applicants 279
  - 8.2.4 Litigating the Criminal Record Exclusion Disparate Impact Discrimination Claim 280
  - 8.2.5 A Note on Criminal History Checks and Disparate Treatment Claims under Title VII 281
  - 8.2.6 Best Practices for Employers Who Do Criminal Records Checks 283
- 8.3 Credit History Checks 284
  - 8.3.1 Reasons Why Employers Perform Credit History Checks 285
  - 8.3.2 The Legal Status of Credit Checks for Employment Purposes 287
  - 8.3.3 Another Catch-22 for Applicants 291

<b>8.4 Reference Checks</b>	293
8.4.1 No Liability for Defamation for Employers Who Give Honest Evaluations of Former Employees	294
8.4.2 Reference Checks and the Right to “Informational Privacy”	294
<b>8.5 Internet Background Checks</b>	297
8.5.1 Some Kinds of Information an Employer May Want to Avoid Acquiring	298
8.5.2 Asking Applicants to Display Their Social Media Pages and Posts	302
8.5.3 Using the Internet to Learn More about Applicants while Protecting against Liability for Unlawful Employment Practices	304
<b>8.6 Using Outside Agencies to Conduct Background Checks: The Fair Credit Reporting Act</b>	305
8.6.1 The FCRA’s Authorization and Disclosure Requirements	305
8.6.2 No Obligation for Employers to Reconsider Applicants Rejected on the Basis of Incorrect Information Supplied by a Third-Party Consumer Reporting Agency	308

## Chapter 9

### **Hiring Employees versus Engaging Independent Contractors**

<b>9.1 Employee or Independent Contractor: A Hypothetical</b>	315
<b>9.2 An Agreement to Work as an Independent Contractor Has No Legal Significance</b>	316
9.2.1 The Classic Independent Contractor	317
9.2.2 The Fair Labor Standards Act Test to Determine Whether a Worker Is an Employee or an Independent Contractor	317
9.2.3 The Internal Revenue Code Test to Determine Whether a Worker Is an Employee or an Independent Contractor	319
<b>9.3 Five Key Factors</b>	323
9.3.1 The Nature and Degree of the Employer’s Control over the Worker	323
9.3.2 Opportunity for Profit or Loss	328
9.3.3 Integral Part of the Employer’s Business	331
9.3.4 Exclusivity and Duration of the Relationship	332
9.3.5 The Right to Discharge the Worker	334
<b>9.4 The Conclusion: Paradise County Has Three New Employees</b>	335

<b>9.5</b>	<b>Some Difficult Cases</b>	335
9.5.1	Positions Funded through Grants	335
9.5.2	Adjunct or Part-Time Instructors in Colleges, Recreation and Parks Departments, or Employee Training and Development Programs	337
9.5.3	Physicians	338
<b>9.6</b>	<b>A Price to Pay</b>	340
<b>9.7</b>	<b>Worker Classification and Employee Benefits</b>	341
<b>9.8</b>	<b>Most Public Sector Workers Are Employees, Not Independent Contractors</b>	344

## Chapter 10

### **Applicant Records: Confidentiality and Retention**

<b>10.1</b>	<b>Confidentiality of Applicant Records</b>	347
10.1.1	Disclosure of Applicant Information to the Public	348
10.1.2	Disclosure of Applicant Information within the Hiring Organization	349
10.1.3	Confidentiality of Applicant Medical and Genetic Information	350
<b>10.2</b>	<b>Aggregate Information about Applicants Required for Equal Employment Opportunity Commission Reporting Purposes</b>	351
<b>10.3</b>	<b>Retention of Applicant Records</b>	352
10.3.1	Retention of Applicant Records under Federal Antidiscrimination Statutes	353
10.3.2	Retention of Applicant Records under North Carolina Law	354

## Appendix 1

### **Application of Employment Laws to Small Employers**

357

## Appendix 2

### **Affirmative Action Today in North Carolina Government Employment**

361

**Appendix 3**

**Validation of Employment Selection Devices That Cause Disparate Impact** 385

**Appendix 4**

**Model Summary of Employee Rights for Fair Credit Reporting Act Compliance** 391

**Appendix 5**

**Equal Employment Opportunity Commission State and Local Government Information (EEO-4)** 395

**Case Index** 401

**Statute Index** 415

**Subject Index** 425



# Preface

Like my previous book, *Employee Benefits Law for North Carolina Local Government Employers*, published in 2009, *Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers* grew out of my School of Government experiences in teaching and advising local government employers. It is the first in a series of books that will replace the School of Government's general employment reference work, *Employment Law: A Guide for North Carolina Public Employers*, the third edition of which is now out of date. Rather than write a book that surveys employment law, I have decided to write a series of books about distinct topics in employment law, including the hiring process, the Fair Labor Standards Act, constitutional issues, privacy in public employment, and discharge and discipline. This book addresses the process of recruitment and selection, which can be particularly challenging for employers as it is governed by a patchwork of federal and state laws. Although many discussions are applicable to community college and state government hiring, the book focuses on the recruitment and selection issues that face local government employers.

I had two main goals in writing *Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers*. First, I wanted to answer some of the basic, recurring questions about what federal and state law requires of public employers with respect to advertising openings and interviewing applicants. These are topics about which I receive regular inquiries from local government employers by telephone or email. I also spend considerable time discussing these topics with participants in the School of Government's Introduction

to Public Employment Law course and its Municipal and County Administration course. Second, I wanted to bring some coherence to an area where the many different sources of law sometimes leave human resources personnel and local government attorneys feeling concerned that one or another legal consideration may have been overlooked. I have seen how committed North Carolina's local government and community college employers are to achieving a workforce composed of individuals who have excellent training and skills, have a commitment to public service, and also reflect the diversity of the communities they serve. My broader goal is to help them do this by providing a more in-depth look at the legal issues that typically arise at each stage of the hiring process than a survey of employment law is able to do.

I would like to thank my School of Government colleague Bob Joyce for a detailed reading of the manuscript and for his many helpful comments and suggestions. I would also like to thank Mike Smith, Dean of the School of Government, for supporting this project by approving me for a writing leave during the 2011–2012 academic year.

Diane M. Juffras  
Professor of Public Law and Government  
March 2013