

SOG contempt resources (selected)

- North Carolina Trial Judges' Bench Book, DCJ Volume 2, Chapter 4, Contempt (most comprehensive)
- Contempt (overview), AOJ Bulletin, M. Crowell 2015: (http://sogpubs.unc.edu/electronicversions/pdfs/aojb1503.pdf)
- Contempt of Court Online training module (https://www.sog.unc.edu/courses/online-modules/contempt-court)
- Numerous blog posts at "On the Civil Side": (civil.sog.unc.edu/)
- Numerous blog posts at Criminal Law Blog (nccriminallaw.sog.unc.edu)

UNC















Criminal contempt - Grounds ior committed during the sitting of a court and directly tending to interrupt its proc edings. Willful behavior committed during the sitting of a court in its immediate view and presence and directly tending to impair respect due its authority. (2) Willful disobedience of, resistance to, or interference with a court's lawful process, order, directive, or instruction or its execution. execution. (4) Willid refusal to be sworn or affirmed as a witness, or, when so sworn or affirmed, willful refusal to answer any legal and proper question when the refusal is not legally justified. (5) Willid justification of a report of the proceedings in a court that is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present danger of imminent and serious threat to the administration of justice, made with knowledge that it was false or with reckless divergard of whether it was false. So preson, however, may be punished for publishing a turbiful report of proceedings in a court. (6) Willid or grossly negligent failure by an officer of the court to perform his duties in an official transaction. (7) Willid or grossly negligent failure to comply with schedules and practices of the court resulting in substantial interference with the boxiness of the court. (8) Willful refusal to testify or produce other information upon the order of a judge acting pursuant to Article 61 of Chapter 15A, Granting of Immunity to Witnesses. (10) Any other act or omission specified elsewhere in the General Statutes of North Carolina as grounds for criminal contempt

G.S. 5A-11(a)

Criminal contempt - Grounds



Criminal contempt - Grounds

(1) Willful behavior committed during the sitting of a court and directly tending to interrupt its proceedings.

Examples:

UNC

- Attorney repeatedly demanding to be heard (after warnings to stop) and inciting his purported client to disrupt proceedings. In re Nakell (1991).
- Mobile phone ringing? See State v. Phair (2008)
- Williad communication with a juror in an improper attempt to influence his deliberations.
 Williad refusal by a defendant to comply with a condition of probation.
 Williad refusal by a defendant to comply with a condition of probation.
 Williad refusal to accept post-release supervision retacomply with the terms of post-release supervision of a priorare of Arrices 27A.
 Chapter 4 of the General Statute. "Williad refusal to accept post-release supervision in order to be returned to priors orserve out the remainder of the supervision's sentence.
 Any other act or omission specified elsewhere in the General Statutes of North Carolina as grounds for crimpial contempt.
 Any other act or omission specified elsewhere in the General Statutes of North Carolina as grounds for company.











UNC SCHOOL OF GOVERNMENT





(3) Willful disobedience of, resistance to, or interference with a court's lawful process, order, directive, or instruction or its execution.

Examples:

- Attempting to coerce witness not to obey subpoena to appear. State v. Wall (1980)
- Disobeying order to stay away from judge's offices. State v. Simon (2007)
- Disobeying order to turn over control of assets to receiver. Osmar (1979)
- Disobeying order to keep children away from sex offender. State v. Mastor (2015)
- Juror conducting own investigations. State v. Pierce (1999)

UNC



SCHOOL OF GOVERNMENT





Criminal contempt - Grounds

 Willid behavior committed during the sitting of a court and directly tending to interrupt its proceedings.
 Willid behavior committed during the sitting of a court in its immediate view and presence and directly tending to impair the respect due is subtroft;
 Willid idubbedence of, resistance to, or interference with a court's lawful process, order, directly, or instruction or its carcetton.
 Willid idubbedence of, resistance to, or interference with a court's lawful process, order, directly, or instruction or its carcetton.
 Willid indubbedence of, resistance to, or interference with a court's lawful process, order, directly, willid refusal to answer any legal and proper question when the refusal an its legally listlifted.
 Willid publication of a report of the proceedings in a court that is prossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present (7) Williful or grosssly negligent failure to comply with schedules and practices of the court resulting in substantial interference with the business of the court.
 The transmission of the proceedings in the proceeding because hadn't been paid. Store v. Key (2007)

 But, State v. Chriscoe (1987): Failure of witness to appear promptly at 9:30 was not violation of order because not subpoenaed, not disruptive to schedule.

UNC

UNC

"[T[hat degree of interference with the courts' business that is real, and monomentary or illusory." "If a court not directly tanding to interrupt its proceedings. "If a court in its immediate with and presence and directly tanding to impart in a courts business that is real, and monomentary or illusory." "If a dout in the courts' business that is real, and monomentary or illusory." "If a dout in the courts' business that is real, and monomentary or illusory." "If a dout in the courts' business that is real, and monomentary or illusory." "If a dout in the courts' business of a report of the proceedings in a court hat is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and illusory inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and is grossly inaccurate and presents a clear and present "If a dout in the proceedings in a court and indicate the answer and the courts."

State v. Key (2007)
But, State v. Chriscoe (1987): Failure of witness to appear promptly at 9:30 was not
violation of order because not subpenaed, not disruptive to schedule.

UNC

SCHOOL OF GOVERNMENT

<section-header><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><list-item><section-header>

















Criminal contem	pt - Procedure
Summary proceeding	Plenary proceeding
• Direct contempt <u>only</u>	 All <u>in</u>direct contempt Direct contempt (at court's option)
UNC VERSON OF GOVERNMENT	











Criminal Contempt - Procedure "summary opportunity to respond"

"...[i]ntended not to provide for a hearing, or anything approaching that...but merely to assure that the alleged contemnor had an opportunity to point out instances of gross mistake about who committed the contemptuous act or matters of that sort." -Official commentary to 5A-14 (quoted often in cases)





School of government

























CRIMINAL	CIVIL
To <i>punish</i> for an act already committed	To <i>coerce</i> compliance with court order
G.S. 5A-11 to 5A-17	G.S. 5A-21 to 5A-26











Civil contempt – The basis

Failure to comply with an order of a court if

(1)The order remains in force;

UNC

UNC

- (2) The purpose of the order is served by compliance;
- (3)Noncompliance by the person to whom the order is directed is willful; and
- (4) The person to whom the order is directed is able to comply or is able to take reasonable measures to comply.

G.S. 5A-21(a)

Civil contempt – The basis

Failure to comply with an order of a court *if*

(1)The order remains in force; "entered" (e.g.,
 (2)The purpose of the order is served by comparison (CA 2016)

- (3)Noncompliance by the person to whom the order is directed is willful; and
- (4) The person to whom the order is directed is able to comply or is able to take reasonable measures to comply.

G.S. 5A-21(a)

Civil contempt – The basis Failure to comply with an order of a court if (1)The order remains in force; Consent orders (2)The purpose of the order is enforceable by contempt? Court-approved (3)Noncompliance by the pers domestic? In general, directed is willful; and yes. (4) The person to whom the or . Others - Only if court able to comply or is able to makes ff/cl or expressly measures to comply. incorporates settlement terms into judgment UNC





Civil contempt – Intentional

Intentional:

- Parent withholding agreed payment of child's tuition to "leverage" better grades. Barker v. Barker (2013)
- Mother withholding visitation because she was concerned child's father was living with former drug addict. *Baines v. Baines* (2013)
- Not intentional:

UNC UNC

- Father did not willfully "entice" child to stop visiting mother by making child's life at father's house more comfortable. *McKinney* (2017)
 Mather Conduction and the state of the state o
- Mother's Facebook post about child's mis-scheduled soccer match was not clear violation of prohibition on "derogatory statements." Chaney (2016)
 Father's reduced child support payment due to oral modification agreement with mother. Meehan (2004)
- Father stopping payments because mother orally agreed he could do so if he waived visitation rights. *Forte* (1983)
- Mother was not required to "force" daughter to visit father pursuant to visitation agreement. Hancock (1996)





Civil contempt – "Ability" to pay **Inadequate findings** More specificity needed Able to work ("able- Liquid assets bodied") - Or, [for purge] assets that can be liquidated ("reasonable "not incompetent" . measures") "x amount of education and experience" "able to work in <u>x</u> industry" Other available "is employed" (or "has been funds/resources employed since...") Other reasonable steps

- Clark, 171 N.C. App. 120 (2005); Hodges, 64 N.C. App. 550 (1983)

UNC

- Available/disposable income













UNC UNC





Civil contempt – purge conditions

- Present ability to do (not future, open-ended, or "indefinite" (Wellons, 229 N.C. App. 164 (2013))
 - Yes: D must "pay \$1000"; or D must "turn over the car to plaintiff" - No:
 - "D must pay child support obligations as they come due"
 "D must pay \$500 per month"
 - - "D may not remove the child from North Carolina in the future without court permission." *Ning Gao* (2013)
- Clear conditions.
 - Yes: "Pay \$<u>x</u>." "Deliver car to Plaintiff's home." "Execute <u>x</u> document." "Pay child's outstanding tuition." "Pay credit card balance as agreed." (Watson 2007) - No:
 - . "D shall not harass or interfere with Plaintiff's custody of the children." Scott v. Scott, 157 N.C. App. 382 (2003)
 - "¹⁰ Shall not any time place the minor children in a situation detrimental to their welfare or punish the minor children in any manner that is stressful, abusive, or detrimental."

UNC

Civil contempt - Procedure

Motion by aggrieved party

- Notice to appear for hearing to determine contempt
 - 5 days' notice
 - Sworn statement/affidavit of reasons

 - Movant has burden (e.g., Tigani, COA 2017)
 - Indigent entitled to counsel

Show cause order/notice of hearing from judge

- . Initiated by affidavit or sworn statement of aggrieved party or judge
- Judge finds probable cause Burden ostensibly shifts to alleged contemnor
- Record must still include evidence required by 5A-21(a)
- 5 days' notice (unless good
- cause shown) Indigent entitled to counsel

UNC UNC







Civil contempt - Appeal

To Court of Appeals

• Within 30 days

UNC

- Immediately appealable due to "substantial right"
- "On the record" review



https://www.facebook.com/paradase.vallescri via/videos/734616606700834/





